MUSICA DISCIPLINA

A YEARBOOK OF THE HISTORY OF MUSIC

Edited by
STANLEY BOORMAN

VOLUME LVIII, 2013

American Institute of Musicology

MUSICA DISCIPLINA

A YEARBOOK OF THE HISTORY OF MUSIC

VOLUME LVIII, 2013

Edited by
STANLEY BOORMAN

Printed in the United States of America.   ♾ The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of the American National Standard for Information Sciences Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-1992.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

* * *

EDITOR'S NOTE

This issue contains papers from the conference "The Gothic Revolution: music in Western Europe 1100–1300," organized by Rob C. Wegman, and held at Princeton University, November 2011. While 14 papers appear here (sometimes revised or expanded), others have been (or will be) published elsewhere.

Since much of the content refers to the same manuscripts or cites the same secondary literature, bibliographies at the ends of individual contributions have been replaced by a General Bibliography, to be found at the end of the volume. Articles included in that bibliography are cited in short form in all papers: any studies cited only once and in an individual paper, or that do not focus on medieval music, are normally cited in full in the relevant footnote.

CONDUCTUS OR MOTET?
A NEW SOURCE AND A QUESTION OF GENRE

GREGORIO BEVILACQUA

Around the year 1300, the French theorist Johannes de Grocheo made an exceptional attempt to describe and classify all the musical forms in use in the city of Paris. The task was a challenging one, and Johannes was well aware of this, since he opened his categorization as follows:

> Nobis vero non est facile musicam dividere recte, eo quod in recta divi-
> sione membra dividentia debent totam naturam totius divisi evacuare.[1]

> [*It is not easy for us to classify music properly, for in a correct classification the*
> *divided elements must cover the full nature of the whole thing divided*.]

Some of the genres he mentioned were already a hundred years old at the time. Thus, although he himself, much closer to the Ars Antiqua, found it difficult to classify genres, his statement must still be an essential guide for the musicologist who tries to deal with a repertoire now seven centuries old. Such a consideration is particularly appropriate when it comes to the Ars Antiqua genres of the conductus and motet. It is not a case that, to borrow Mark Everist's words, 'definitions of the conductus that seek to explain the entire genre seem doomed to failure.'[2] The difference between the two types of compositions is essentially clear for a great part of the repertoire, consisting in the fact that a conductus is not based on pre-existing material, while a motet is founded on measured bits of plainchant. Yet, some pieces exist that fail to fall into either of these standard categories, displaying uncommon features or being transmitted in different sources with different layouts—although usually conducti were copied in score, while motets had their parts written separately.

---

1. Johannes de Grocheo, *De musica,* in Rohloff, *Der Musiktraktat,* 48.
2. Mark Everist, "Reception and Recomposition," 135.

THE GOTHIC ARCHITECTURE OF
JOHN OF GARLAND'S *DE MENSURABILI MUSICA*

PASCALE DUHAMEL*

The title and the subject of this conference establish a direct association between Parisian polyphony and Gothic architecture. It is a fact that one finds many similar assertions of an association and analogy between Parisian polyphony and Gothic architecture elsewhere in works of music and art history, as well as in booklets accompanying recordings. Authors putting forward these analogies range from Jacques Chailley, Otto von Simson, and Erwin Panofsky, to Jeremy Yudkin, Craig Wright and Umberto Eco,[1] and their various analogies suggest different links between Parisian organum and the Gothic cathedral. Some present organum as an acoustic answer to the space of the new Gothic church. For others, there is more likely to be an aesthetic answer. For Craig Wright, Gustav Reese, and Heinrich Husmann,[2] the related components between polyphony and architecture of the Gothic period are due to a specific *Zeitgeist*.

The title of this conference suggests also that there was an important shift in musical culture during the period between 1100 and 1300, to which we can apply the Gothic label. Aside from the fact that Parisian polyphony and Gothic architecture developed during roughly the same period, and belong to closely related spheres of 13th-century society, the reasons why one labels Parisian polyphony as Gothic are rarely examined. In my study on the subject,[3] I delved into various aspects of the many links asserted by scholars and musicians between Parisian polyphony and Gothic cathedrals, and propose an explanation.

---

1. Jacques Chailley, *Histoire musicale,* 156–57; Otto von Simson, *The Gothic Cathedral,* 21–26; Erwin Panofsky, *Architecture gothique,* 100; Jeremy Yudkin, *Music in medieval Europe,* 363; Craig Wright, *Music and Ceremony,* 235; Umberto Eco, *Le nom de la rose,* 516–17.

2. Wright, *Music and Ceremony,* 235 ; Gustave Reese, *Music in the Middle Ages,* 294 ; Heinrich Husmann, "Notre-Dame Epoche, I," 1700–1701.

3. Pascale Duhamel, *Polyphonie parisienne et architecture.*

MASTER AND DISCIPLE: TEACHING THE COMPOSITION OF POLYPHONY IN THE THIRTEENTH CENTURY

MARK EVERIST

Discoveries of new sources of medieval polyphonic music regularly provoke interest, but frequently could offer more to further our understanding of music in the period between 1150 and 1350.[1] Newly discovered manuscript fragments often preserve works that are already known, and while they may add grist to the mill of studies of *Überlieferung,* or sometimes open up new sites of cultivation for the *conductus, organum* or motet, they do not really challenge fundamental questions of how music was created, received or preserved.[2] So it is a welcome change to be able to report on a newly discovered source that raises questions that strike at the heart of our understanding of much of the music of the thirteenth century. An unassuming flyleaf at the beginning of a copy of Augustine's *Confessions* in the manuscript Reims, Bibliothèque municipale 400 (hereafter F-RS 400) invites us to reconsider questions that invoke the oppositions between plainsong and polyphony, between the organised and the improvised, between literate and oral, and between reading and memory, and even poses some questions about the birth of the motet.[3]

---

1. There are a number of sources that receive a brief notification in the literature and then wait sometimes decades before they are fully assimilated into our understanding of the subject. See for example the fragments of Latin three-part motets and three-part *organum* in Stockholm, Riksarkivet Fr 535 and Fr 813. Gunilla Björkvall, Jan Brunius and Anna Wolodarski, in "Flerstämmig musik från medeltiden," provide an elegant paleographical description but clearly acknowledge the need for a musicological engagement with the fragments. Anna Wolodarski, "Gdy pozostały tylko fragmenty," also mentions the fragments but adds nothing to the earlier article.

2. To take but a single genre, none of the newly-discovered sources for the *conductus* discovered in the last half century has pointed to the existence of a new composition. See Norbert Eickermann, "Auf der Spur"; Jürg Stenzl, "Eine unbekannte Notre-Dame-Quelle (concerning CH-SO, S.231; now CH-MSbk, S.231); Mark Everist, "A Reconstructed Source" (on GB-Ob, Auct VI Q 3.17); Everist, "A New Source" (on GB-Cssc, 117*); Martin Staehelin, "Conductus-Fragmente" (on D-Fu, Fragm. lat. VI 41); Everist, "Reception and Recomposition" (regarding F-ME, Bibliothèque de la Ville, Réserve Précieux, Ms 732bis/20, including the single fragment of a possibly unknown *conductus*); and Eva Maschke, "Neue Conductus-Fragmente" (on US-NYcub, N-66; including a lost third voice for the *conductus* "Porta salutis ave").

3. See Charles Samaran et Robert Marichal, *Catalogue des Manuscrits,* 261.

HEARING VOICES: HETEROGLOSSIA, HOMOGLOSSIA, AND THE OLD FRENCH MOTET*

ANNA KATHRYN GRAU

Courtly love songs and polemical rants, Marian odes and drinking songs, misogynistic diatribes and women's love songs: all appear in the upper voices of thirteenth-century French motets. Within the fascicles of a motet manuscript, lyric genres are combined, contrasted, and reinterpreted in polyphonic form. Combined with Latin, liturgically-derived tenors through their musical settings, these varied texts produce a compelling blend of secular and sacred that has intrigued literary and musical scholars, perhaps most notably Sylvia Huot and David Rothenberg.[1] Attention to this hybridity, largely through the lens of "troping" or allegory, has had the effect of limiting the repertory of motets in which most scholars of music-text relationships are interested; it has encouraged readers to find motets and their texts interesting only to the extent that they correspond with the medieval desire to read on different levels, to reinterpret and recontextualize the secular in terms of the sacred. Such studies generally find significance in the sacred resonances of the stock imagery and vocabulary of Old French secular texts.[2]

Despite the interest among scholars of secular monophonic lyric in the figure of the lyric "I," motet studies only rarely consider the figure or character whose voice is implied by the text, the courtly lovers, Marian devotees and misogynistic clerics whose characteristic language often defines the text as secular. In studies of subjectivity as revealed by medieval troubadours, in

---

1. Sylvia Huot, *Allegorical Play,* and more recently David J. Rothenberg, *The Flower of Paradise*. A number of shorter studies also demonstrate this approach, under the name of troping or glossing, among them Gerald R. Hoekstra, "The French Motet as Trope."

2. This privileging of allegorical relationships in discussion of the motet has begun to extend to textbooks in recent years: Richard Taruskin and Craig Wright each include in their anthology a motet that includes an overlap between Marian and *pastourelle* imagery.—Holzer, Taruskin and Gibbs, *Oxford Anthology of Western Music,* I; Roden, Wright and Simms, *Anthology for Music in Western Civilization*, Volume A.

THREE HYPOTHETICAL PHASES OF NOTRE DAME ORGANUM PERFORMANCE PRACTICE

SOLOMON GUHL-MILLER

It used to be that matters were merely extremely difficult for performers coming new to Notre Dame organum. Until recently it was only the rhythm that was unclear, while the pitches themselves could be relied upon. But new trends in Ars Antiqua studies regarding the employment of memory and rhetorical devices are making matters utterly hopeless for the newcomer. The recent analyses by Guillaume Gross and Jennifer Roth-Burnette highlight the fact that what is written down in the Notre Dame sources is, in many cases, no more than a representation of one possible performance.[1] What we see in the surviving manuscripts are single versions in which the (possibly) normally unnotated sections—where a performer well acquainted with musico-rhetorical devices would have improvised material using his set of memorized formulae—are written out. As our knowledge of these rhetorical devices increases and we become able to break down every organum in terms of its use of rhetoric, a new edition of Notre Dame organa may one day appear, in which these segments of written-out musico-rhetorical devices are removed or included as ossia alternatives and replaced with device names like *contrarium* (figures that ascend and then immediately descend or vice versa) or *gradatio* (figures in a sequence). The segments marked as ex 1a and ex 1b in Figure 1, from *01 Iudea et Iherusalem,* in *F*, fol. 65*r*, might ultimately appear in such an edition as "notated" in Example 1.

Thus the performer would be expected to improvise using his or her knowledge both of formulae garnered from careful study of the Vatican Organum Treatise (I-Rvat, Ottob. Lat. 3025), and of the musico-rhetorical devices which have begun to be outlined by Gross and Roth-Burnette.

---

1. See: Guillaume Gross, *Chanter en polyphonie*; and Jennifer Roth-Burnette, "Organizing Scripture." These of course build upon the work of various scholars of chant and early polypony holding the same view, the most vocal of whom are Anna Maria Busse Berger, Edward Roesner, and Leo Treitler.

WALTER OF EVESHAM AND *DE SPECULATIONE MUSICAE*: AUTHORITY OF MUSIC THEORY IN MEDIEVAL ENGLAND*

ELINA G. HAMILTON

> Let us begin to sing from the Heliconian Muses, who possess the great and holy mountain of Helicon and dance on their soft feet around the violet-dark fountain and the alter of Cronus' mighty son.
>
> And after they have washed their tender skin in Permessus or Hippocrene or holy Olmeius, they perform choral dances on highest Helicon, beautiful, lovely ones, and move nimbly with their feet. Starting out from there, shrouded in thick invisibility, by night they walk, sending forth their very beautiful voice....[1]

With their soft feet dancing among the deep-blue springs of Mount Olympia and their sweet voices singing the praises of gods and of man, the daughters of Zeus were certainly no strangers to music theorists in the late Middle Ages. In Part II of the fourteenth-century English treatise *De speculatione musicae*, we find Walter, monk of music from Evesham Abbey,[2] writing that

> Musica quidem est modulationis peritia sono tactuque consistens, et dicitur a musis, quasi poete finxerunt sonos esse filias et memorie, quia, nisi memoria teneantur, soni pereunt. [3]

---

1. Hesiod, *Theogony*, 3.

2. The author of *De speculatione musicae* is noted today as Walter Odington, although the only source GB-Ccc 410 notes its author as 'fratris Walteri monachi Eveshamiae musici.' Through an extensive source study for the music treatise and other attributed scientific works, I suggest in my doctoral thesis that there were two authors active sometime around the turn of the 14th-century: Walter of Evesham Abbey, author of *De speculatione musicae*, and Walter of Eynsham Abbey, scientist and author of *Ycocedron*. For the remainder of this article, the author of *De speculatione musicae* will be addressed as Walter of Evesham.

3. *De speculatione musicae:* GB-Ccc 410, fol. 6v.

PORTA SALUTIS AVE: MANUSCRIPT CULTURE, MATERIAL CULTURE, AND MUSIC*

EVA M. MASCHKE

Porta salutis ave per te patet exitus a ve
venit ab Eva ve ve quia tollis ave.

Whereas the polyphonic conductus and its transcription, particularly of the *cum littera*-passages, have been a widely debated and highly controversial issue, conductus texts and their reception have not received similar attention. Past research has focused on topical and datable conducti.[1] In order to categorize the repertoire, scholars have provided thematic lists in which the conducti are classified according to their subject matter.[2] Szövérffy registers more than a hundred conducti related to Marian devotion.[3] One of them, the conductus

1. Thomas Payne, "Datable 'Notre Dame' Conductus"; Ernest Sanders, "Style and Technique."

2. Joseph Szövérffy, *Lateinische Conductus-Texte des Mittelalters*.

3. Ibid., 22–23.

PROPORTION AND SYMBOLISM IN SOME ARS ANTIQUA MOTETS

ALEJANDRO ENRIQUE PLANCHART

Our view of the nature and typology of the late medieval motet was for decades colored by an almost automatic association of this genre with the notion of isorhythm; and the history of that term in contemporary scholarship presents a paradigmatic instance of the ways of twentieth-century historiography, where a seemingly casual and ultimately not entirely accurate description used by Friedrich Ludwig in connection with a motet of the late Ars antiqua[1] was gradually transformed by Ludwig and others into a general description of a host of rhythmic and formal procedures found largely, but not exclusively, in motets of the fourteenth and early fifteenth century.[2] The label of isorhythm hides as much as it reveals, for it seems to have blinded scholars for a time to a number of traits that show considerable variation among the different repertories that medieval writers and musicians would have recognized as motets. A thoughtful corrective to this was provided by Ernest Sanders in a number of important studies, particularly his essay in the memorial volume for Leo Schrade,[3] where he noted the extent to which the transition from Ars antiqua to Ars nova motets is a gradual one, despite the revolutionary nature of some of Philippe de Vitry's innovations in terms of notation and of the expansion of the formal structure of the motet.

As Sanders noted, a number of motets of the Ars antiqua in France already exhibit traits that were to become stylistic hallmarks of the fourteenth-century motet, such as the repetition of an extended tenor rhythmic pattern not bound by the regularities of modal rhythm, and the use of isorhythmic hocketing in at least one of the upper voices as an indicator of section articu-

---

1. Friedrich Ludwig, "Die 50 Beispiele Coussemakers," p. 223. The motet in question is *On parole / A Paris / Frese nouvele,* no. 319 in Hans Tischler, *The Montpellier Codex,* Part III, Nos. 7–8, p. 189. All the numbers for motets in *Mo* in this study are those in Tischler's edition.

2. A summary history of this process appears in Ernest H. Sanders, "Isorhythm," as well as in Margaret Bent, "Isorhyhm."

3. Ernest Sanders, "The Medieval Motet."

NOTRE DAME *CONDUCTUS* AND THE RENEWAL OF SPEECH AT THE TURN OF THE 12TH AND 13TH CENTURIES: THE SONOROUS FRAMING OF THE CONGREGATION.

ANNE-ZOÉ RILLON-MARNE

The revival of pastoral speech in the thirteenth century was a movement with roots in the scholarly culture and theological texts of the "moral biblical school" of the twelfth century. It answered a long-established aspiration on the part of the clergy to broadcast the word of God and to make the Bible message accessible to the faithful. But it was also inscribed in a new world, in which the clerics felt the urge to arm themselves with words against heresies, both near and far, and to look for means to fight against the moral dissolution of the urban communities in the context of the advent of the University.

The beginning of the thirteenth century was a time of change, in which projects and impulses initiated during the second part of the preceding century came to fruition, sowing the seeds for the creation of a new, thriving society, with Paris at its heart and head. In this regard, pastoral techniques experienced the most important changes in their history.[1] At the same time and in the same place, there was an increase in moralistic themes in the musical realm, as Latin texts were set to melodies.[2] This is true of some motets but most of all of the conductus. Moralization was characterised by textual content as well as by language and direct communication with the audience through exclamations, use of oral rhetoric devices, addresses to the audience and use of the second person singular. These elements interact during performance and reach out to listeners, making them react and convincing them to reconsider their behaviour by copying Scriptural models. Music production was thus at the service of the word, which aimed at teaching believers how to arm themselves against sin in order to reach salvation.

---

1. Jean Longère, *La prédication médiévale*; Louis-Jacques Bataillon, *La prédication au XIIIe siècle*; Nicole Bériou, *L'avènement des maîtres de la Parole*; Marie-Madeleine Davy, *Les sermons universitaires*; David D'Avray, *The Preaching of the Friars*.

2. This phenomenon is bound to the revival of ethical poetry during the 12th century; see Tuomas L. M. Lehtonen, *Fortuna, Money and the Sublunar World*; Pascale Bourgain, "Le tournant littéraire"; Karl Strecker, *Moralischsatirische Gedichte Walters von Chatillon*; Helga Schüppert, *Kirchenkritik in der lateinischen Lyrik*.

THE REPERTOIRE OF PARISIAN *CONDUCTUS*
AS A CASE-STUDY IN THE TONAL ORGANIZATION
OF GOTHIC POLYPHONY

DANIELE SABAINO

1. The main purpose of this paper is to observe some major aspects of the tonal organization of Gothic polyphony through the lens of the Parisian conductus repertoire.

More precisely, the paper will seek to discover:

(a) whether any sense of 'tonal orientation' can be detected also in Gothic polyphony, and, in case, which elements set up that orientation, and

(b) whether that possible orientation can or cannot be related to the categories of the (theoretical) chant tradition.

This second aim links the paper to a broader research project currently in progress at the Department of Musicology of the University of Pavia/Cremona, Italy, under the supervision of the present writer and Marco Mangani. The project intends to test the pertinence of the concept of 'mode' as a factor of tonal organization in Medieval and Renaissance polyphony by reading side by side, whenever possible, actual music and music theory in order to discern what they are linked by and what they are divided from.[1]

In fact—as is well known—the very pertinence of the idea of mode has been widely criticized during the last decades, especially with regard to 15th and 16th century polyphony. Debates have focused, on different occasions, on the cultural/theoretical/analytical relevance of the notion of modality; on the

---

1. See Marco Mangani and Daniele Sabaino, "'Modo Novo' or 'Modo Antichissimo'? Some Remarks About *La*-Modes in Zarlino's Theoretical Thought," in *Early Music. Context And Ideas* (Kraków: Institute of Musicology, Jagellonian University, 2003), 36–49; Mangani and Sabaino, "Tonal Types and Modal Attribution in Late Renaissance Polyphony. New Observations," *Acta Musicologica* 80 (2008,: 231–50; Sabaino, "Lasso's Motets: A Case Study in Different Layers of Tonal Type Problematic Nature," in *Early Music Context and Ideas 2* (Kraków: Institute of Musicology, Jagellonian University, 2008), 38–57; and Mangani and Sabaino, "L'organizzazione dello spazio sonoro nell'Orfeo di Claudio Monteverdi: modelli e strutture, Philomusica online 8/2 (2009), 1–49. Other studies on the tonal organization of Italian Trecento and Josquin's music by the same authors are forthcoming.

TRANSMITTING A COMPOSITIONAL PROCESS:
TWO THIRTEENTH-CENTURY MOTETS

GAËL SAINT-CRICQ

In the field of the thirteenth-century motet, the issue of transmission is still in need of further exploration, in order to improve our understanding of the creative process behind the motet and its relationships to related genres.

Transmission studies usually involve the examination of the movement of a repertoire or work from one manuscript, place or period to another, assessing the influence and the mutation of the corpus under consideration and its interactions with other repertoires and works. For the thirteenth-century motet, as for many medieval genres, this kind of investigation consti-tutes a rather ungratifying task, hampered by missing sources, uncertainties in dating and provenance, and a lack of evidence concerning interconnections between extant sources. More specifically, transmission studies of the motet are complicated by the insatiable nature of a repertoire which is fed by, and related to, liturgical polyphony, dance-like song, Latin song, trouvère chanson and French romances. Inquiries into the transmission of the motet also pose a problem for the very object of study: which pieces of evidence should we hunt down in order to reconstruct a line of transmission between several motets? Identifying particular links between works in effect raises the challenging question of continuity within a repertoire that is fundamentally unstable, multi-directional, protean and anonymous.

Several studies have highlighted two main indicators which would allow us to explore connections between several motets and bring to light dynamics around which they federate. Most obviously, the positing of a 'polyphonic prototype' constitutes the favourite lead in such an investigation, inviting us to study the process of transmission by comparing the different copies and 'states' of a motet setting—i.e. with different textual versions and numbers of parts-across a number of manuscripts.[1] An extension of this kind of inquiry, which

---

1. A typical example is found in James Cook's examination of individual transmission of the motets recorded in the manuscript *Cl,* in his "Manuscript transmission." Each work is the subject of a stemmatic analysis, based on the relations between its different versions and the analysis of their divergences.

OVID AND THE THIRTEENTH-CENTURY MOTET: QUOTATION, REINTERPRETATION, AND VERNACULAR HERMENEUTICS*

JENNIFER SALTZSTEIN

The thirteenth-century motet has long been associated with learning. Medieval witnesses to the genre, such as Johannes de Grocheio, stressed the discernment and skill of the motet's audiences, cautioning, "Cantus autem iste non debet coram vulgaribus propinari, eo quod eius subtilitatem non advertunt nec in eius auditu delectantur sed coram litteratis et illis, qui subtilitates artium sunt quaerentes" (*This kind of music should not be set before a lay public because they are not alert to its refinement nor are they delighted in hearing it, but before the clergy and those who look for the refinements of skills.*)[1] In his monograph, *Discarding Images,* Christopher Page criticized the scholarly tendency to characterize these medieval listeners as an intellectual elite. He reinterpreted the accounts left by medieval theorists, broadening the motet's audience considerably, to include parish priests, boys and adolescents studying grammar, and all manner of university students.[2] Yet even under Page's revisionist interpretation, we must view the motet as a clerical genre, a characterization that is supported by a host of other studies.[3] Thomas B. Payne's research has revealed the significant role Philip the Chancellor played in the motet genre's early development.[4] Philip's motet texts deal with issues particularly relevant to clerics during the first quarter of the thirteenth century, such as the rise of the mendicant orders and corruption among the secular clergy. Indeed, Payne

---

1. Christopher Page, "Johannes de Grocheio on Secular Music," 36.

2. Page, *Discarding Images*, 68–84.

3. For two of the most detailed responses to Page's *Discarding Images,* see Philip Weller, "Frames and Images"; and Suzannah Clark, "S'en dirai chançonete."

4. Thomas B. Payne, "*Associa tecum in patria.*"

ENGLISH POLYPHONIC MUSIC AROUND 1300: GENRE AND REPERTORY IN CAMBRIDGE, CORPUS CHRISTI MS 8

AMY WILLIAMSON

The surviving sources of thirteenth-century English polyphony show a greater tolerance of a wide range of stylistic and generic types than do the sources of Continental music of the period. Genres cultivated by the Notre-Dame school are relatively few in number and form clearly differentiable groups; insular composers, however, employed a much wider range of genres, harder to classify and often overlapping in styles and techniques. This is reflected in the organisation of some sources, which are arranged in a far less rigid and homogenous manner than those found on the Continent. It is not uncommon to find manuscripts mixing monophony with polyphony, with different numbers of voice parts, themes, formats and genres. However, the extent to which this applies has not yet been fully explored. The most recent account of the subject states that "…the meagre remains of most insular sources do suggest organisation in a similarly rigid fashion" to that of the Continent, and that "only a comparatively small number of sources blur this picture."[1]

However, this view does not take account of *all* the extant sources of polyphony, and therefore presents an unbalanced overview of the repertory. As well as omitting at least a third of relevant extant sources, it fails to consider several important factors: not enough emphasis is placed upon the original collation and contiguity of fragments; there is no consideration of the number of voice parts present or the formats in which the pieces have been notated; and it does not recognise that genre in England is frequently a matter of conjecture. Losseff's study, furthermore, brushes over the irregularities in many of the pieces, forcing them into categories that fit with Continental models, and ignoring the features that set them apart so drastically from the music across the Channel.

---

1. Nicky Losseff, *The Best Concords,* 149–50.

HOCKETING AND THE IMPERFECT MODES
IN RELATION TO POETIC EXPRESSION
IN THE THIRTEENTH CENTURY

MARY E. WOLINSKI

Hocketing in thirteenth-century music has various effects or functions, depending on the context in which it occurs. Its rapid or unusual alternation of tones and rests forcefully draws attention to itself, and to the words, if any, by crisp or halting enunciation. Extensive hocketing can affect our understanding of the meaning of the work, especially in motets. Hocketing neither creates any one mood nor serves a single function. Rather, it can provide embellishment, articulate a text, or, in some cases, comment on the meaning of a poem within passages of rhythmically complex melismas. The three motets that follow—*In Bethleem Herodes*/*In Bethleem, Povre secours*/*Gaude chorus omnium*/*Angelus,* and *Amor potest conqueri*/*Ad amorem sequitur*/*Tenor*— demonstrate how composers used hocketing in various ways over the course of the century. Hocketing moved from the level of longs and breves to that of semibreves, reflecting an increasing complexity in the rhythmic system. In so doing, it also grew from simple shouts and exclamations to subtle declamation. Although the techniques may have varied, throughout the era hocketing helped to project the emotions expressed by a poem through increasingly nuanced and complex effects.

In polyphony of the early thirteenth century, there were constraints on the measured rhythm of discant. Hocketing rarely altered the patterns of the rhythmic modes established in a given passage of music. Within texted music hocketing created monosyllabic exclamations or, in the more subtle manner of the imperfect modes, emphasized two-syllable words or four-syllable poetic lines by framing them with rests. These kinds of early texted hocketing were musically no different from those found in untexted discant passages. As striking as these effects may be, their rhythmic uniformity is part of the reason why it is difficult to decide whether a hocketing piece was originally texted or melismatic.

Given this problem, it is even more difficult to determine the original function of the hocketing passage, even when compositions survive in both texted and untexted versions. This is the case with the clausulae and motets

GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abbreviations

CS   *Scriptorum de musica medii aevi nova series a Gerbertina altera,* edited by
            Edmond de Coussemaker. Paris: Durand, 1864–76; reprinted
            Hildesheim: Olms, 1963.

CSM   Corpus Scriptorum de Musica.

GS   *Scriptores ecclesiastici de musica sacra,* edited by Martin Gerbert. Sankt
            Blasien, 1784; reprinted Milan: Bollettino bibliografico musicale, 1931.

MGG   *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart.* Unless otherwise specified, refer-
            ences are to the second edition, edited by Ludwig Finscher.

MLO   *Le Magnus Liber Organi de Notre-Dame de Paris,* general editor Edward
            Roesner. 7 vol. Les Remparts, Monaco: Editions de l'Oiseau-Lyre, 1993.

PMFC   Polyphonic Music of the Fourteenth Century. Monaco: Oiseau-Lyre, 1956.

RISM   Répertoire International des Sources Musicales.

Manuscripts—with the generally-used abbreviations

—   A-Gu (Graz, Universitätsbibliothek), 409.

—   A-Gu (Graz, Universitätsbibliothek), 756.

—   A-Iu (Innsbruck, Universitätsbibliothek), Cod.343.

—   A-Iu (Innsbruck, Universitätsbibliothek), Cod.497.

—   A-KR (Kremsmünster, Benediktiner-Stift, Regenterei), Ms. 10.

—   A-Wn (Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek), 4119.

—   B-Br (Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique), 3136 (ms 428–42).

—   CH-BEb (Bern, Burgerbibliothek), 211.

—   CH-BEb (Bern, Burgerbibliothek), 389.

—   CH-EN (Engelberg, Stiftsbibliothek), 104.

—   CH-EN (Engelberg, Stiftsbibliothek), 314.

—   CH-MSbk (Mariastein, Benedikterkloster), S.231.

—   CH-SGs (St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek), 383.