## CORPVS SCRIPTORVM DE MVSICA

21

### **AVRELIANI REOMENSIS**

## MVSICA DISCIPLINA

Edidit LAWRENCE GUSHEE



AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY 1975

## CORPUS SCRIPTORUM DE MUSICA

GILBERT REANEY
General Editor
(1966)

# AURELIAN OF RÉÔME MUSICA DISCIPLINA

Edited by LAWRENCE GUSHEE

AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY

ARMEN CARAPETYAN

Director

## CORPVS SCRIPTORVM DE MVSICA

21

### **AVRELIANI REOMENSIS**

## MVSICA DISCIPLINA

Edidit LAWRENCE GUSHEE



AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY 1975

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

| PREFACE                         |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 9  |
|---------------------------------|-----------|---------------|--------|--------|---------|---|---|---|---|---|-----|----|
| INTRODUCTION                    |           |               |        |        | •       |   |   |   |   |   |     | 11 |
| The Title of                    | the Wo    | rk .          |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 13 |
| The Author                      | and his   | Milie         | u.     |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 14 |
| Dating .                        |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 15 |
| Dating . Subsequent             | Career of | of Mus        | sica d | iscipl | ina     |   |   |   |   |   |     | 16 |
| SIGLA CODICUM                   | SOURCE    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 19 |
| THE MANUSCRIPT                  | SOURCE    | s.            |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 20 |
| Chart of Di                     | stributio | n of I        | ext    |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 21 |
| The V Grou                      |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 23 |
| The OxC To                      | ext       |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 30 |
| The RP Gro                      | oup       |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 34 |
| Stemma Co                       |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 37 |
| OTHER MANUSCRI                  | 2Tq       |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 41 |
| MANUSCRIPT INVI                 | ENTORIES  |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 42 |
| EDITORIAL POLIC                 | Υ.        |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 50 |
| ABBREVIATIONS                   |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 52 |
| AURELIANI REOMI<br>Prefatory Po |           |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 53 |
| Prefatory Po<br>Dedicatory      | Enictle   |               | •      |        | •       | • | • | • | • | • | •   | 53 |
| Capitula op                     | Episiic   |               | •      |        | •       | • | • | • | • | • | •   | 57 |
| Capitula op                     | De lau    | . ,<br>da mir | cicae  | disci  | nlina   |   | • | • | • | • | •   | 58 |
| Cap. II                         | De nor    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 50 |
| Cap. II                         |           | forme         |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   | 10- | 61 |
| Cap. III                        | Quod 1    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   | •   | 64 |
| Cap. IV                         | Quod 1    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 66 |
| Cap. V                          | De voc    |               |        |        | irusic. | - |   |   |   |   |     | 68 |
| Cap. VI                         | Quod 1    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 00 |
| Cup. VI                         | diam      |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 70 |
| Cap. VII                        | Quid si   |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 77 |
| Cap. VIII                       | De ton    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 78 |
| Cap. IX                         | Quae i    |               |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 83 |
| Cap. X                          | De aut    | -             |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 85 |
| Cap. XI                         | De pla    | _             |        |        |         |   |   |   |   |   |     | 90 |

| Cap. X     | IL   | De au  | itentu  | deuteri              |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 93  |
|------------|------|--------|---------|----------------------|--------|-------|------|--------|-------|------|----|---|-----|
| Cap. X     | III  | De pl  | agis d  | euteri               |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 95  |
| Cap. X     | ΊV   | De au  | itentu  | triti                |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 101 |
| Cap. X     | ΚV   | De pl  | agis tı | iti .                |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 103 |
| Cap. X     | (VI  | De au  | itentu  | tetrardi             |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 106 |
| Cap. X     | (VII | De pl  | agis te | etrardi              |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 111 |
| Cap. X     | IIIV | Deute  | rolog   | ium ton              | orum   | ı     |      |        |       |      |    |   | 114 |
| Cap. X     |      | pro    | fundit  | liter ver<br>asque d | isceri | natui | rom  | niun   | ton   | orun | ı. |   | 118 |
| Cap. X     | (X   | qua    | e die   | ac discip            | jue i  | uxta  | co   | nstiti | ution |      |    | - |     |
|            |      | pre    | cedeni  | tium pre             | cinu   | ntur  | in e | cclesi | ia]   |      | •  | • | 129 |
|            |      |        |         |                      |        |       |      |        |       |      |    |   | 126 |
| APPENDIX:  |      | S ABBR | EVIAT   | US Ox C              | •      | •     | •    | •      | •     | •    | •  | • | 136 |
| INDEX CANT | MUU  | •      | •       |                      |        |       | •    |        | •     | •    | -  | • | 155 |
| PLATES .   |      |        | •       |                      | •      |       |      |        | •     | •    |    | • | 165 |

#### **PREFACE**

The present edition of Aurelian of Réôme's Musica disciplina originated as part of my doctoral dissertation (Ph.D., Yale, 1963) in which the text was garnished with extensive commentary on certain aspects of Aurelian's work. The garnish has considerably wilted with the passage of time, and I am now led to publish separately the nucleus of the dissertation, i.e. Aurelian's text, with some substantial changes in the variae lectiones, discussion of some versions and MSS which have come to my attention—in particular, Oxford, Bodleian Library, Canon. misc. 212—and a rearrangement of the system of reference to the text.

While my interest in medieval music was stimulated and nourished in the first instance by the late Leo Schrade, the special impetus to the study of Aurelian came from a seminar in medieval music theory led by David Hughes at Yale in 1957-58. William G. Waite was, as director of my dissertation, the assiduous and indispensable critic of my logic and literary style. In more recent years many others have been kind enough to assist my work in one way or another: R. W. Hunt, John F. Benton, Bernhard Bischoff, Father Baudouin de Gaiffier, Dom Jacques Hourlier, Solange Corbin, Joseph B. Trapp, Kenneth Levy, Peter Fischer, and two former students, R. Peter Wolf and Noel Swerdlow. Special acknowledgment, however, is due to Michel Huglo, who has brought his erudition to bear on dozens of difficult points, besides leading me to the Oxford MS mentioned above. Above all, my wife's unquestioning assuraption that it was important that Musica disciplina appear, her material assistance in those onerous clerical tasks which nonetheless demand expert knowledge, and finally her reading of some incredibly garbled first drafts have been essential to the completion of this edition.

In conclusion, I can only repeat the author's traditional assumption of full responsibility for those errors which may

### INTRODUCTION

Some of my readers may know a story by Edgar Allen Poe in which a young man makes the acquaintance of the valorous Brevet Brigadier-General John A. B. C. Smith, a person of singularly commanding presence and physical perfection. Subsequently, the young man visits the General early in the day as he is dressing — to discover that about all there is to him is a squeaky little voice. The commanding presence and impressive physique is prosthetic, for the General had been used up in the Indian wars.

So with Aurelian of Réôme. If one takes to heart my conjectures in the pages to follow about the various pseudo-fragments of Aurelian — called pseudo-fragments because they are not actually descended from his work — then there is precious little of Aurelian left. Or rather his contribution will have to be regarded, for the most part, as the wielding of scissors and the paste-pot.

It is of course a well-known result of *Quellenforschung* to leave the actual work in ruins, once its every word and thought has been traced to a source. The case of *Musica disciplina* is, however, not one in which a hapless author has undeservedly fallen victim to a *Quellenforscher*. In his prefatory poem Aurelian describes himself as a compiler:

Your Aurelian has chosen, brought together and written,

O pastor Bernard, this meagre tribute.1

In another passage where he appears to claim some originality he also admits the contrary:

And I myself have been eager to put together a new work with things that I have been able to discover here and there in the sayings of elders, and that I have heard from you and from others.<sup>2</sup>

This is more than conventional modesty on Aurelian's part as a quick inspection of his chapters I through VII shows. Most of this part of his work consists of literal and unacknowledged borrowings from Boethius, Cassiodorus and Isidore. I must stress "unacknowledged"; the only unequivocal citation is that of Boethius for part of chapter VI. Chapter XX is also a patchwork, but without a single source reference; and there are substantial reasons to question the originality of at least the first third of chapter VIII.

What remains, from partway through chapter VIII through chapter XIX, is the most interesting part to most students since it encompasses — with a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Aure- tuus legi, compsi scribsique -lianus, Pastor Bernarde, munus hoc exiguum.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ac per hoc quae sparsim in veterum dictis invenire potui, sed et quae a vobis et ab aliis audivi, ipse novum opus condere studui. (Praef. 7).

#### EDITORIAL POLICY

The present edition of *Musica disciplina* is a virtual transcription of the text as found in the oldest MS now extant, V. Unless there were very pressing reasons to do otherwise, no alterations, apart from those of punctuation and expansion of abbreviations, and the normalization of rubrics, have been made in the Valenciennes text. The copious punctuation of V has, however, frequently been followed. The reader will recognize such alterations by the presence of square brackets in the text: these usually indicate an emendation on the basis of other MSS, but if no variant is recorded in the notes, the emendation should be understood to be conjectural.

I trust that I am correct in believing that no one equipped to read the text in the first place will be hampered by retention of V's orthography. The differences between it and so-called normalized Latin spelling are less than those which a moderately adventurous reader of English encounters. I also think it highly unlikely that Aurelian used such normalized spelling and am sure that in a few instances a non-classical spelling can explain subsequent corruptions. I have been inconsistent to the extent of ignoring the cedilla often but not always found on the e replacing classical ae, and in emending a few particularly egregious and potentially misleading words, such as Aurelian's obscultans for auscultans (XX.38), or his ac for hac (XVIII.4). It seemed a good idea, however, to keep the anomalous spelling crthara where it occurs in V and Pom, as it may have something to do with Celtic crwth.

If Aurelian's spelling was unclassical, so also was his grammar, and it is not always an easy matter to construe. The problem for the text critic is, of course, to know how much benefit of the doubt to grant his author. In XII.6, for example, qui is almost certainly wrong, coming from the author's uncertainty as to the gender of invitatorium. The reader will encounter a number of grammatical tangles of this sort, and others, which I have chosen not to emend out of existence. There are occasional blemishes of a logical kind which are, in my opinion, no less authentic. A particularly good example is XVIII.19, in which the total of chants mentioned in words is three, that in figures is fourteen, and the actual total is twelve.

I have perhaps been overcautious in emending the V text from shared variants of F and RC. The fact is, however, that their number is small and their significance minor: I did not see the merit of choosing readings from the collateral branch merely out of a spirit of fair play. In any event, the reader is welcome — and justified — to choose any such readings as may please him. Since Gerbert's edition was — at least in principle — a careful copy of F, there was no reason to include any variations arising from copying errors.

#### INCIPIUNT CAPITULA PREFATI OPERIS

- I De laude musice discipline.
- II De nomine et inventoribus eius, et quomodo numerorum forme invente fuerint.
- III Ouod musice tria sint genera.
- IIII Quod habeat humana musica partes.
  - V De vocum nominibus. [f.59v]
- VI Ouod habeat musica cum numero maximam concordiam.
- VII Ouid sit inter musicum et cantorem.
- VIII De tonis octo.
- VIIII Quae ipsis inscribantur tonis.
  - X De autentu proti.
  - XI De plagis proti.
  - XII De autentu deuteri.
- XIII De plagis deuteri.
- XIIII De autentu triti.
  - XV De plagis triti.
- XVI De autentu tetrardi.
- XVII De plagis tetrardi.
- XVIII Deuterologium tonorum.
- XVIIII Norma qualiter versuum spissitudo, raritas, celsitudo, profunditasque discernatur omnium tonorum.
  - XX Quod ab hac disciplina composita extant modulamina, quae die noctuque iuxta constitutionem patrum precedentium precinuntur in ecclesia.

V Pom B F RC

index capitulorum

ad cap. 4 quot RC\*

humanas B

ad cap. 19 celsitudo raritas Pom

ad cap. 20 consuetudinem B

praesciuntur F (praecinuntur GS)

#### CAPITULUM I

### De laude musicae disciplinae

<sup>1</sup>Musicam disciplinam non esse contempnendam, multa et antiquorum gentilium videlicet et sanctorum librorum affirmat [f.60] auctoritas. <sup>2</sup>Innumera siquidem inveniuntur et apud gentiles et apud nostros per eam acta proficua. <sup>3</sup>Ut enim fabulosa taceam: quomodo scilicet Orpheus coniugem ab inferis lire modulamine, pellectis qui apud inferos erant, ad superos revocaverit; <sup>4</sup>et qualiter bestias, tigres ac delfines, marina scilicet animalia necnon serpentes, quidam cantilena mites reddiderunt. <sup>5</sup>Certe Asclipiadem asserunt certissime hominem mente captum per musicam dulcedinem sanitati propriae restituisse.

<sup>6</sup>Ut vero ad nostros veniam: quid preclarius agi in talibus potuit quam quod legimus per hanc artem David egisse <sup>7</sup>ut scilicet Saulem cantu cithare a demone liberaret, quem medicorum ars victa desperabat? <sup>8</sup>Certe et beatum

```
3 Cassiodorus Instit. II.v.9 (ed. Mynors)
```

#### V Pom B F RC RP OxB, OxS

"capitulum" cum numero proprio passim in B F RC: numerus solus in V sed saepe abscissus Pom: om RP L OxB, OxS

inscr de laude musicae disciplinae V Pom B F RP] de laude musicae cum gl mg musica graece dicitur concordia et consonantia et non solum (\*\*\*) cantu musica dicitur sed etiam de concordia et convenientia dicitur v\*\*e contra eos qui inter se discordant et dissi\*\*nt am(us)eteros vocamus inscr repetitur in mg passim RC: om inscr L OxB<sub>1</sub> OxS

1 disciplinam] om OxB<sub>1</sub>

contempnendam] contempdam B: contemnendam F affirmat] confirmat OxB<sub>1</sub>

#### V Pom B F RC RP L OxB, OxS

- 2 aucta OxS
- coniugem] coniugem suam euridicen RP: euridicen ss OxS
  pellectis V Pom L OxB<sub>1</sub> OxS] id est illectis ad dulcedinem ss OxS:
  pellentis B F RC: placatis, mg pell(\*\*\*) RP

qui] que, mg qui RP: que OxB,

erat OxB

ad superos : superos L

revocaverit codd RP\*] revocarit RP

4 tygrides OxB<sub>1</sub>

necnon] nec RP: necnon et OxB<sub>1</sub> quidam] quidem RP L OxS reddiderit RP OxS (OxB<sub>1</sub>?)

- 5 musice RP
- 7 scythare L

victa codd RP\* | vita RP

8 que ante] quem L: quae OxS

<sup>4</sup> Isid. Etym. III.xvii.3 (ed. Lindsay)

<sup>5</sup> Cassiod. Instit. II.v.9 vel Isid. Etym. IV.xiii.3

<sup>7</sup> Isid. Etym. III.xviii.3

<sup>8</sup> IV Reg 3.15

<sup>41</sup>Extitere etenim nonnulli cantores qui quasdam esse antiphonas quae nulle earum regulae possent aptari asserverunt; unde pius augustus avus vester Carolus paterque totius orbis iiii augere iussit quorum hic vocabula subter tenentur inserta:

### ANANNO NOEANE NONANNOEANE NOEANE

<sup>42</sup>Et quia gloriabantur Greci suo se ingenio octo indeptos esse tonos, maluit ille duodenarium adimplere numerum. Tunc demum Greci possent ut nobis esse communes et eorum habere contubernium philosophia cum Latinorum; et ne forte inferiores invenirentur gradu, itidem[que] quattuor ediderunt tonos, quorum hic prescribere censui litteraturam:

#### NENOTENEANO NOEANO ANNO ANNES

<sup>43</sup>Qui tamen toni modernis temporibus inventi tam Latinorum quam Grecorum licet litteraturam inequalem habeant, tamen semper ad priores octo

```
V F RC RP L (P1) OxC
41
      etenim] autem L
      nulli OxC
      possint L OxC
      pius augustus avus vester Carolus paterque totius orbis V F RC: pius augustus Carolus
      paterque totius orbis RP L (P<sub>1</sub>): pius augustus paterque patrie nostre imperator karolus
      quorum - NOEANE<sub>2</sub> om RP L (P<sub>1</sub>)
      echemata (vocabula ANANNO etc.) om in textu sed ins mg RC
      NOEANE2] NOENE OxC
42
      se om F
      indeptos esse] indemptos habere OxC
      tunc] tum L OxC
      greci possent ut] greci possent ut (ut ss) RP: ut (ss) greci/(ut er) possint P1
      gradus OxC
      itidemque] itidem V
      ediderunt] addiderunt (P1)
      tonos om OxC
      censui] consuevi (P<sub>1</sub>)
      litteraturam V* F RC OxC] litterarum V RP L (: om P1)
      NENOTENEANO NOEANO ANNO ANNES V F OXC (NENO TENEANNO
      NOEANNO ANNO ANNES OxC; nenoteneano/noneano annoannes F): om RC in
      textu sed ins mg male divisa nenote/neano/nonea/noan/noan/nes: NENOTENE.
      anonone anoanno. annes RP: ANES. NONAN. NOEANE/NOEANO ANNO
      L (: NENOTENEANO. AIANE/OEANNES. ANO ANO. Neannes. anaiais. anaie/
      ianes. anaiesnes. Nana annes. anaie. aies P<sub>1</sub>)
43
      quam( ) V : quam RP (P1) OxC : quamque F RC L
      litteraturam codd V*] litterarum V
      habeant om OxC
```

primores OxC