

MISCELLANEA

*Qui musicam in se habet*

Edited by

Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn,  
& Stanley Boorman

AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY

Paul L. Ranzini, Director

Miscellanea 9

*Qui musicam in se habet*

STUDIES IN HONOR OF ALEJANDRO ENRIQUE PLANCHART

Edited by

Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn,  
& Stanley Boorman



AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY

## AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY

The American Institute of Musicology publishes seven series of critical editions, scholarly studies, reference works, and a journal all dedicated to the study of the Medieval, Renaissance, and early Baroque eras. The publications of the Institute are used by scholars and performers alike and constitute a major core collection of early music and theoretical texts on music.

For information on establishing a standing order to any of our series, or for editorial guidelines on submitting proposals, please contact:

American Institute of Musicology, Inc.  
Middleton, Wisconsin  
800 736-0070 (U.S. book orders)  
608 836-9000 (phone)  
608 831-8200 (fax)  
<http://www.corpusmusicae.com>  
[orders@corpusmusicae.com](mailto:orders@corpusmusicae.com)  
[info@corpusmusicae.com](mailto:info@corpusmusicae.com)

© 2015 by American Institute of Musicology, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

ISBN13: 978-1-59551-514-8

Cover image: Celebrant sprinkling the altar with holy water during an Asperges ceremony. Painted by Girolamo da Milano in a 15th-century noted Olivetan gradual. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, MS 1184. Used with permission.

Printed in the United States of America. © The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of the American National Standard for Information Sciences Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-1992.

### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Qui musicam in se habet : studies in honor of Alejandro Enrique Planchart / edited by Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn, & Stanley Boorman.  
pages cm. -- (Miscellanea ; 9)  
Includes bibliographical references and index.  
ISBN 978-1-59551-514-8 (alk. paper)  
1. Music--History and criticism. I. Planchart, Alejandro Enrique honouree. II. Zayaruznaya, Anna. III. Blackburn, Bonnie J. IV. Boorman, Stanley, 1939-  
ML55.P625 2015  
780.9--dc23

2015030763

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments .....	XI
List of Illustrations .....	XIII
List of Music Examples .....	XVII
Abbreviations .....	XXI
Note on Terminology .....	XVI

\* \* \*

1. Introduction .....	3
Anna Zayaruznaya	
2. Fanfare .....	11
<i>Agricola IXa: Je nay dueil</i>	
Fabrice Fitch	
<b>I. Chant Transmitted and Reformed</b>	
3. The Old Milanese Hymn for Saint John the Baptist .....	21
Angelo Rusconi	
4. The Masses for the Holy Cross in Some Italian Manuscripts .....	41
Luisa Nardini	
5. Updating the Alleluia at Pistoia .....	71
James Vincent Maiello	
6. Guillaume-Gabriel Nivers's <i>Plain-chant musical</i> Motets in the Repertory of the Maison Royale de Saint-Louis at Saint-Cyr .....	93
Deborah Kauffman	
7. <i>Missa Eclectica</i> : Lou Harrison and Artistic Ideologies after Vatican II .....	121
Rebecca G. Marchand	

## II. Cults

8. The Tropes for Saint Androchius at the Abbeys of Saint Martial  
and Saint Martin in Limoges ..... 149  
James Grier
9. The Office of Saint Donatus at Benevento ..... 157  
Thomas Forrest Kelly
10. The Great Procession of St. Agatha in Florence and its Antiphon  
*Paganorum multitudo* ..... 175  
Michel Huglo† and Barbara Hagg-Huglo
11. Popular Piety in Renaissance Mantua: The Lauda and Flagellant  
Confraternities ..... 183  
William F. Prizer

## III. The Lives of Singers

12. New Light on Recruiting Singers during the Papal Schism:  
A Letter from Pope Urban VI ..... 225  
Evan A. MacCarthy
13. Orfeo: *Dominus Presbiter Orpheus de Padua* ..... 231  
Margaret Bent
14. Dialogus de Johanne Sohier alias Fede ..... 257  
Jane Alden and David Fiala
15. *Splendeurs et misères des suppliques*: Breton Singers in the Papal  
Chapel in the Late Fifteenth and Early Sixteenth Centuries ..... 285  
Richard Sherr
16. Forty-Eight Nights at the Opera: *La compañía lírica francesa*  
in Manila in 1865 ..... 315  
William John Summers

## IV. The Lives of Songs

17. Apropos *Ma fin est mon commencement* and *Tout par compas*:  
Two Canonic Rondeaux from Reims ..... 349  
Alexander Blachly
18. Osservazioni sulla ballata polistrofica nella tradizione musicale  
del Trecento ..... 381  
Agostino Ziino

19. The Adventures of *La belle se siet* ..... 413  
 Robert Nosow
20. Affection Unmasked? About the Misleading Transmission of a  
 “Lost” Song by Johannes Tourout ..... 427  
 Jaap van Benthem

## V. Ceremonial Motets

21. The Latin Poetry of Johannes Ciconia and “Guilhermus” ..... 437  
 Leofranc Holford-Strevens
22. The Italian Job: Ciconia, Du Fay, and the Musical Aesthetics  
 of the Fifteenth-Century Italian Motet ..... 471  
 Carolann Buff
23. The Pagan Virgin? Du Fay’s *Salve Flos*, a Second Consecration  
 Motet for Santa Maria del Fiore ..... 501  
 Michael K. Phelps

## VI. Sources Reconstructed and Reconsidered

24. *Maria Unbound*: Reconstructing and Contextualizing the Antwerp  
 Manuscript Fragments M6 ..... 517  
 Kristine K. Forney and Alicia M. Doyle
25. The Velvet Songbooks ..... 551  
 David Fallows
26. Crispin van Stappen and Petrucci’s *Motetti a cinque* ..... 563  
 Sean Gallagher
27. Alamire, Pierre de la Rue, and Manuscript Production in the Time  
 of Charles V ..... 575  
 Honey Meconi

## VII. Attribution and Authority

28. The Status of a Du Fay Contrafactum ..... 617  
 Reinhard Strohm
29. Sound and Structure: *Le marteau sans maître* and *Mille regretz* ..... 635  
 Joshua Rifkin
30. Josquin as Authority in Morales’s Four-Voice *Missa de Beata Virgine* ..... 675  
 Alison Sanders McFarland

## VIII. Practicing Theory

31. The World according to Anonymous IV ..... 693  
Rob C. Wegman
32. Whatever You Do, Don't Sing D: On the Notation of Obrecht's  
*Missa L'homme armé* ..... 731  
Emily Zazulia
33. "Notes Secretly Fitted Together": Theorists on Enigmatic  
Canons—and on Josquin's Hercules Mass? ..... 743  
Bonnie J. Blackburn

## IX. Music as Experience

34. *Organa dulcisona docto modulamine compta*: Rhetoric and Musical  
Composition in the Winchester *Organa* ..... 763  
Susan Rankin
35. Peaks, Valleys, and Form in Ockeghem's Sacred Music ..... 781  
Jesse Rodin
36. Gershwin at the Piano: Performance Practice Methodology  
and its Limits ..... 805  
Jonathan D. Bellman
37. Six Sets of Tropes from Nevers ..... 821  
Richard L. Crocker

\* \* \*

## Appendix

- Publications, Compositions, and Recordings by Alejandro Enrique Planchart ..... 827
- Notes on Contributors ..... 837
- Index of Manuscripts ..... 843
- General Index ..... 845

# 1

## Introduction

Anna Zayaruznaya

No better epithet would seem to be available for Alejandro Enrique Planchart, the honoree of this volume, than the stirring words with which Jacobus begins the third chapter of the first book of his *Speculum musicae*: “Musicus est qui musicam in se habet.”<sup>1</sup> The *musicus* has *musica* within him, as a part of himself. Alejandro is verily bursting with music, and with musicology: he is never far from singing the pertinent passage or producing the relevant name, source, or date—facts he retrieves from the multiply-grooved tablets of his well-trained and remarkable memory. Truly he is a person who has *musica in se*. Of course, we should be wary of anachronism: the term *musicus* is decidedly academic as codified by Boethius, who ranks the *musicus* above the *cantor*. The former understands the theory, whereas “mere” singers who make beautiful sounds that they cannot explain are little better than beasts—an image memorably encapsulated in the opening verses of Guido of Arezzo’s *Regulae*.<sup>2</sup> This is a less apt description of Alejandro, who is more likely to praise singers and blame musicologists than the reverse. Jacobus would probably have sympathized. Though he upholds Boethius’s distinction in conceding that those who cannot sing because of, say, deficient voices will not thereby lose the name of *musicus* as long as they understand the consonances and other aspects of *musica theorica*,<sup>3</sup> Jacobus’s praise is the highest for those in whom the practical and theoretical are united:

---

1. *Jacobi Leodiensis Speculum musicae*, ed. Roger Bragard, 7 vols. in 8, CSM 3 (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1955–73), 3:17.

2. For Guido’s verse see Dolores Pesce, *Guido d’Arezzo’s Regule rithmice, Prologus in antiphonarium, and Epistola ad Michaelem: A Critical Text and Translation, with an Introduction, Annotations, Indices, and New Manuscript Inventories* (Ottawa: The Institute of Mediaeval Music, 1999), 330–33. On medieval characterizations of singers as bestial see Elizabeth Eva Leach, *Sung Birds: Music, Nature, and Poetry in the Later Middle Ages* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2007), 43–54. See also Erich Reimer, “Musicus und Cantor: Zur Sozialgeschichte eines musikalischen Lehrstücks,” *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 35 (1978): 1–32.

3. “Qui autem cantare nesciunt, vel propter defectum vocis, vel quia talem non habent usum, sciunt tamen consonantiarum naturas et alia ad musicam theoreticam spectantia, musici non amittunt nomen”; *Jacobi Leodiensis Speculum musicae*, 3:17.



## 4

### The Masses for the Holy Cross in Some Italian Manuscripts\*

Luisa Nardini

As Alejandro Planchart has taught us in his many contributions to chant studies, but particularly in his essay on the geography of Martinmas, the transmission of liturgical formularies throughout Europe often followed multidirectional trajectories of exchange.<sup>1</sup> This is particularly true for those feasts that display an unstable tradition in the earliest chant manuscripts. The two feasts of the Holy Cross—the Invention, or Finding (3 May), and the Exaltation (14 September)—because of their complex history, in which Byzantine influences intermix with the Gallican and Old Roman matrices of Gregorian chant, can be considered excellent case studies. By combining chants of different dates and origins, they clearly document the work of assemblage that medieval cantors undertook to provide new liturgical formularies. In turn, Proper chants for these feasts allow us to formulate hypotheses about manuscript circulation, to speculate about written exemplars, and to discuss the cross-fertilization between liturgy, hagiography, and visual arts at the turn of the second millennium.

---

\* Research for this essay was started when I was a research fellow at the University of California, Santa Barbara, and therefore benefitted tremendously from discussions and exchanges with Alejandro Planchart. I presented excerpts from this research at the International Seminar “I repertori di canto piano nell’Italia settentrionale” in Recco (Italy), July 2001; the Conference of the Medieval Academy of America in Toronto, April 2007; a lecture series at Texas State University, October 2008; and the Meeting of the American Musicological Society, November 2007. Strong encouragement to pursue this research also came from Joseph Dyer. Elena Olivieri helped solve technical problems with tables and examples. Fr. Patrick Hala of the Éditions de Solesmes, Dr. Lorenzo Pongiluppi from the Archivio Capitolare of Modena, and Monsignor Pierantonio Gios of the Biblioteca Capitolare of Padua granted permission for reproduction of images from RoA123, Mod7, and Pad47. To all of them goes my deepest gratitude.

A list of the sigla used in the essay, together with brief descriptions of the manuscripts themselves and bibliographical references, can be found in Appendix 1.

1. Alejandro E. Planchart, “The Geography of Martinmas,” in *Western Plainchant in the First Millennium: Studies in the Medieval Liturgy and Its Music*, ed. Sean Gallagher et al. (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), 119–56.