MISCELLANEA

Qui musicam in se habet

Edited by
Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn,
& Stanley Boorman

AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY
Paul L. Ranzini, Director
Qui musicam in se habet

Studies in Honor of Alejandro Enrique Planchart

Edited by
Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn, & Stanley Boorman

American Institute of Musicology
Table of Contents

Acknowledgments ................................................................. xi
List of Illustrations .............................................................. XIII
List of Music Examples ........................................................ XVII
Abbreviations ...................................................................... XXI
Note on Terminology .............................................................. XVI

*  *  *

1. Introduction ................................................................. 3
   Anna Zayaruznaya

2. Fanfare ................................................................. 11
   Agricola IXa: Je nay duell
   Fabrice Fitch

I. Chant Transmitted and Reformed

3. The Old Milanese Hymn for Saint John the Baptist ................. 21
   Angelo Rusconi

4. The Masses for the Holy Cross in Some Italian Manuscripts .......... 41
   Luisa Nardini

5. Updating the Alleluia at Pistoia ........................................... 71
   James Vincent Maiello

6. Guillaume-Gabriel Nivers’s Plain-chant musical Motets in the Repertory of the Maison Royale de Saint-Louis at Saint-Cyr ................. 93
   Deborah Kauffman

7. Missa Eclectica: Lou Harrison and Artistic Ideologies after Vatican II .......... 121
   Rebecca G. Marchand
II. Cults

8. The Tropes for Saint Androchius at the Abbeys of Saint Martial and Saint Martin in Limoges
   James Grier 149

9. The Office of Saint Donatus at Benevento
   Thomas Forrest Kelly 157

10. The Great Procession of St. Agatha in Florence and its Antiphon
    *Paganorum multitudo*
    Michel Huglo† and Barbara Haggh-Huglo 175

11. Popular Piety in Renaissance Mantua: The Lauda and Flagellant Confraternities
    William F. Prizer 183

III. The Lives of Singers

12. New Light on Recruiting Singers during the Papal Schism: A Letter from Pope Urban VI
    Evan A. MacCarthy 225

13. Orfeo: *Dominus Presbiter Orpheus de Padua*
    Margaret Bent 231

14. Dialogus de Johanne Sohier alias Fede
    Jane Alden and David Fiala 257

15. Splendeurs et misères des suppliques: Breton Singers in the Papal Chapel in the Late Fifteenth and Early Sixteenth Centuries
    Richard Sherr 285

16. Forty-Eight Nights at the Opera: *La compañía lírica francesa*
    in Manila in 1865
    William John Summers 315

IV. The Lives of Songs

17. Apropos *Ma fin est mon commencement* and *Tout par comças*
    Two Canonie Rondeaux from Reims
    Alexander Blachly 349

18. Osservazioni sulla ballata polistrofica nella tradizione musicale del Trecento
    Agostino Ziino 381
19. The Adventures of La belle se siet ................................................. 413
   Robert Nosow

20. Affection Unmasked? About the Misleading Transmission of a
    “Lost” Song by Johannes Tourout ....................................... 427
   Jaap van Benthem

V. Ceremonial Motets
21. The Latin Poetry of Johannes Ciconia and “Guilhermus” ...................... 437
    Leofranc Holford-Strevens

22. The Italian Job: Ciconia, Du Fay, and the Musical Aesthetics
    of the Fifteenth-Century Italian Motet .................................. 471
    Carolann Buff

23. The Pagan Virgin? Du Fay’s Salve Flos, a Second Consecration
    Motet for Santa Maria del Fiore ......................................... 501
    Michael K. Phelps

VI. Sources Reconstructed and Reconsidered
24. Maria Unbound: Reconstructing and Contextualizing the Antwerp
    Manuscript Fragments M6 .................................................... 517
    Kristine K. Forney and Alicia M. Doyle

25. The Velvet Songbooks ............................................................... 551
    David Fallows

26. Crispin van Stappen and Petrucci’s Motetti a cinque ......................... 563
    Sean Gallagher

27. Alamire, Pierre de la Rue, and Manuscript Production in the Time
    of Charles V ................................................................. 575
    Honey Meconi

VII. Attribution and Authority
28. The Status of a Du Fay Contrafactum ....................................... 617
    Reinhard Strohm

29. Sound and Structure: Le marteau sans maître and Mille regretz ............ 635
    Joshua Rifkin

30. Josquin as Authority in Morales’s Four-Voice Missa de Beata Virgine ........ 675
    Alison Sanders McFarland
VIII. Practicing Theory
31. The World according to Anonymous IV ................................. 693
   Rob C. Wegman
32. Whatever You Do, Don’t Sing D: On the Notation of Obrecht’s
    Missa L’homme armé .................................................. 731
    Emily Zazulia
33. “Notes Secretly Fitted Together”: Theorists on Enigmatic
    Canons—and on Josquin’s Hercules Mass? ............................ 743
    Bonnie J. Blackburn

IX. Music as Experience
34. Organa dulcisona docto modulamine compta: Rhetoric and Musical
    Composition in the Winchester Organa ............................ 763
    Susan Rankin
35. Peaks, Valleys, and Form in Ockeghem’s Sacred Music ............ 781
    Jesse Rodin
36. Gershwin at the Piano: Performance Practice Methodology
    and its Limits ......................................................... 805
    Jonathan D. Bellman
37. Six Sets of Tropes from Nevers ........................................ 821
    Richard L. Crocker

* * *

Appendix
Publications, Compositions, and Recordings by Alejandro Enrique Planchart . . 827
Notes on Contributors ...................................................... 837
Index of Manuscripts ....................................................... 843
General Index ............................................................... 845
Introduction

Anna Zayaruznaya

No better epithet would seem to be available for Alejandro Enrique Planchart, the honoree of this volume, than the stirring words with which Jacobus begins the third chapter of the first book of his Speculum musice: “Musicus est qui musicam in se habet.”¹ The musicus has musica within him, as a part of himself. Alejandro is verily bursting with music, and with musicology: he is never far from singing the pertinent passage or producing the relevant name, source, or date—facts he retrieves from the multiply-grooved tablets of his well-trained and remarkable memory. Truly he is a person who has musica in se. Of course, we should be wary of anachronism: the term musicus is decidedly academic as codified by Boethius, who ranks the musicus above the cantor. The former understands the theory, whereas “mere” singers who make beautiful sounds that they cannot explain are little better than beasts—an image memorably encapsulated in the opening verses of Guido of Arezzo’s Regulæ.² This is a less apt description of Alejandro, who is more likely to praise singers and blame musicologists than the reverse. Jacobus would probably have sympathized. Though he upholds Boethius’s distinction in conceding that those who cannot sing because of, say, deficient voices will not thereby lose the name of musicus as long as they understand the consonances and other aspects of musica theorica,³ Jacobus’s praise is the highest for those in whom the practical and theoretical are united:

³. “Qui autem cantare nesciunt, vel propter defectum vocis, vel quia tales non habent usum, sciant tamen consonantium naturas et alia ad musicam theoricam spectantia, musicae non amittunt nomen”, Jacobi Leodiensis Speculum musice, 3:17.
The Masses for the Holy Cross
in Some Italian Manuscripts*

Luisa Nardini

As Alejandro Planchart has taught us in his many contributions to chant studies, but particularly in his essay on the geography of Martinmas, the transmission of liturgical formularies throughout Europe often followed multidirectional trajectories of exchange.¹ This is particularly true for those feasts that display an unstable tradition in the earliest chant manuscripts. The two feasts of the Holy Cross—the Invention, or Finding (3 May), and the Exaltation (14 September)—because of their complex history, in which Byzantine influences intermix with the Gallican and Old Roman matrices of Gregorian chant, can be considered excellent case studies. By combining chants of different dates and origins, they clearly document the work of assemblage that medieval cantors undertook to provide new liturgical formularies. In turn, Proper chants for these feasts allow us to formulate hypotheses about manuscript circulation, to speculate about written exemplars, and to discuss the cross-fertilization between liturgy, hagiography, and visual arts at the turn of the second millennium.